



# 2018-2019 Mid-Term Credibility Plan Review

PI: Qing Nie

#	Ten Simple Rules	REVIEWER #1		REVIEWER #2	
		Considered in the Credibility Plan?	Comments	Considered in the Credibility Plan?	Comments
1	Define context clearly	insufficient	very little detail provided	insufficient	Not clear when this model could be used (e.g., animal model vs. human; for healthy individuals or not)
2	Use appropriate data	sufficient	The PI plans to use experimental data for model development and consult expert opinion throughout the project	insufficient	It's not clear what the model parameters are and what sources of information will be used to set the parameters. If they come from a database or publication, please cite. Only a few examples are needed in the report, and ideally all are documented somewhere.
3	Evaluate within context	sufficient	The PI's model development plan is well thought out	sufficient	Thorough evaluation plan on multiple scale. Would be good to also consider code verification.
4	List limitations explicitly	insufficient	not described	insufficient	not described
5	Use version control	insufficient	not described	insufficient	not described
6	Document adequately	sufficient	The PI plans to engage outside code development experts	insufficient	not described
7	Disseminate broadly	insufficient	not described	insufficient	not described
8	Get independent reviews	sufficient	The PI plans to continually engage (external) SMEs	sufficient	Thoughtful plan to engage external evaluators from three different fields
9	Test competing implementations	insufficient	not described, although it also is not known if a competing implementation exists	insufficient	not described
10	Conform to standards	insufficient	not described	insufficient	not described

## General Comments

### Reviewer 1:

The thought process for model development and evaluation is well thought out and to be commended. Please provide additional details about all 10 elements of credibility in future reports so that more meaningful feedback can be provided.

### Reviewer 2:

The awardees have provided a solid plan for some aspects of the Ten Simple Rules. However, the lack of details describing many of the Ten Simple Rules makes it difficult to determine how well the project is meeting the guidelines.